COMPARING STUDENTS' ABILITY IN WRITING RECOUNT TEXT OF GRADE X AND GRADE XI AT SMAN 1 LUBUK ALUNG

Zikra Azkiya[1] and Hamzah[2]
English Department
Faculty of Languages and Arts
State University of Padang
email: zhikkiee@gmail.com

Abstract

This research was about the comparison between students' ability of grade X and grade XI in writing recount text with the topic of an unforgettable experience. This study aimed to compare the level of students' grade X and grade XI ability in writing recount text seen from the generic structure of the text. The research design of this study was descriptive research. The population of this research was all of classes grade X and grade XI of SMAN 1 Lubuk Alung. The sample was taken by using random cluster sampling technique so that the sample obtained was 1 class from grade X and 1 class from grade XI. The instrument used in this study was a test recount text for 45 minutes in at least 100 words. The students' writing was analyzed using recount text writing rubric related to the generic structure of the text. Based on this research, students' ability of grade XI was higher than grade X by looking from the generic structure of recount text. The ability of students grade XI was in 3 (good) category while students grade X was in 2 (weak) category. Nevertheless, there were several parts of the text that students could not understand yet how to write them.

Key words: Comparison, Writing Skill, Recount Text

A. INTRODUCTION

Writing is one of the language skills that required the students to express their ideas and thoughts into a good paragraph that can be understood by the readers. Writing skills is not only about ideas and thoughts but also about the language, content and presentation. Also, writing is a complicated process that enables the writers to explore their ideas and thoughts to be real and concrete (Hamp and Heasley in Fegeech, 2014).

Many research have been done by other countries regarding to writing skills, such as research conducted by Javed, Juan & Nazli (2013) from Malaysia this research proved that that writing skills are one of the most difficult skills for students. Furthemore, Cole & Feng (2015) from China revealed that students have difficulty in writing skills rather than listening and reading. Besides, research was also conducted by Kassem (2017) in Saudi Arabia proved that

---

writing is the most difficult of the four language skills (listening, speaking, reading and writing). Due to those researches, it reveals that students difficult to express and develop their ideas in writing. Even though they have many ideas in their mind, the student cannot reveal it into detail to be a good paragraph.

One of the texts that students must be mastered is Recount text. It is mentioned in Basic Competence (KD) 3.9 – 4.14 which is analyzing the generic structure and language features of recount text along with producing recount text both oral and writen by considering the structure and language features of recount text. Recount text is a text that tells the reader or listener about what happened in the past through a sequence of events (Grace in Sukma, 2015). Furthermore, according to Saragih (2014) Recount text is essentially written to inform about an experience of sequence of related events. So, recount text is a text that tells the reader or listener about an experience which happened in the past through a sequence of related events. Saragih (2014) also mentioned that one of the way to improve students' writing skill was by applied recount text.

It was stated on his research about "The Effectiveness of Using Recount Text to Improve Writing Skill For Grade III Students of Kalam Kudus Elementary School 2 Pematangsiantar". He proved that students' writing skill increased from the pre-test before applying recount text to the post test after applying recount text. It can be seen from the mean of the Post Test (62.10) was higher than the mean of the Pre-test (39.58) before applying recount text. Then, the mean score of the Post Test (77.05) was higher than the Pre-test (61.41) after applying recount text. It means that using recount text has significant affect to the students' mastery in writing recount text genre.

However, there were numbers of students did errors in writing recount text. It is stated in a research conducted by Haris, Ansyar and Radjab (2014). They found that about 79% students at SMAN 1 Sungai Limau could not write a good recount text due to lack of grammar. Another research conducted by Herlina (2014) proved that about 53 students at SMK Negeri 6 Surakarta did an errors in arranging generic structure of recount text. She explains that 3 students did not write the events and 11 students did not write the re-orientation. Hasibuan and Simatupang (2018) also revealed that most common errors did by SMA 4 Padasidimpuan students in writing recount text are using past tense, pronoun and adjective (adjective order). So, it can be concluded that Senior High School still do some mistakes such as in arranging the generic structure of recount text and using grammar (past tense, pronoun and adjective).

There are many studies related to writing skill (Layaaliya, 2015; Nurhidayah, 2017; Anggraini, Candra & Subroto, 2017). Layaaliya (2015) analyzes students' ability in writing argumentative essay in English Teacher Education Department of The State Islamic Sunan Ampel Surabaya. Nurhidayah (2017) analyzes students' ability in writing narrative text in MTs Ali Imron Medan, especially at grade IX. Anggraini, Candra & Subroto (2017) analyzes students' ability in writing descriptive text in SMAN 2 Tanjung Pinang, especially at grade X. In addition, the issues about writing skill focusing on ability are still insteresting to be conducted.

Most of those researchers focused on students ability in writing and its difficulties. Moroever, there has not been any researcher who compared students' ability in writing, so this study presents to fill the gap by comparing students' ability in writing. Therefore, this research focus on comparing students' ability viewed from the generic structure of the text.

An interview with one of English practice teaching at SMAN 1 Lubuk Alung who taught at grade X. The students still did errors in writing, especially in writing recount text. When the students were in daily test, they still did some mistakes such as in analysing the generic structure of recount text, using signal time and grammar. As a result, when the students asked to write a recount text they end up to copy it from internet. Based on this fact, the researcher is interested to find out the comparison ability between grade X who are right now learn about recount text and grade XI who had learnt about recount text in the previous semester.

B. RESEARCH METHOD

This reserach is about the comparison between grade X and XI students' ability in writing recount text. In this research, the writer used used descriptive research. The aim of using descriptive research is to find out the comparison students' grade X and grade XI ability in writing recount text. The population of this research was all classes of grade X and XI at SMAN 1 Lubuk Alung. The grade X consists of 9 classes which devide into two majors, Science and Social. The sample was taken from 1 class from grade X and 1 class from grade XI grade at SMAN 1 Lubuk Lubuk Alung. The technique of random cluster sampling was used in order to take the sample. Random cluster sampling is believable to be appropriate in choosing sample since the population has similar characteristics. In taking the sample, the researcher used lottery sytstem. First, the researcher wrote9 classes from grade X and 9 classes from grade XI in the small paper. Then, two of them was choosen randomly, one for grade X and one for grade XI. The class taken in the piece of paper was the sample of this research.

This research used writing test recount in taking the data. Since recount text is a text that tells about experience happened in the past, so the students asked to write their and unforgetable expererience in form of recount text. The test was done by the students of grade X and grade XI after giving them the topic of recount text which they are going to write. In fact, recount text required the students to write about an experience or event happened in the past. So, the researcher decided to choose the topic related to themselve which was unforgetable experience. The students wrote the recount text in 45 minutes in at least 100 words. The test was done by the students after giving them the topic of recount text which they are going to write. Then the researcher collected students' recount text.

In analyzing students' writing recount text, the researcher used anlytic score. The data analyzed based on aspects from each parts of recount text, they are orientation, events, and reorientation. The rating scales were categorized from 5 (excellent) 4 (very good) until 1 (poor). They are 4 (very good), 3 (good), 2 (weak), and 1 (poor). Then, the data will be calculated to get the mean score in

every indicator, they are orientation, events, and orientation, by using the formula from Gay (2009:307). The mean score were catagorized in five categories based on the rating scale. Then, the researcher grouped the data to find out the percentage of grade X and XI students in writing a recount text by using percentage formula by Arikunto . Afterwards, Then, the researcher will describe the per centage of the students' ability in producing recount text concerning with some criteria in the test whether they scored 5 (excellent) 4 (very good), or 3 (good), or 2 (weak), or1 (poor)'s ability. Lastly, the researcher will compare the score of the students in writing recount text in order to find out the comparison students' ability in writing.

C. RESULT AND DISCUSSION
1. Students' grade X Ability in Writing Recount Text
Table 1
Students' Grade X Ability in Writing Recount Text Viewed from Generic Structure

No.	Indicators	Scores	Answer of Research Questions
1.	Orientation	2,89	
	Events	2,65	2,48 (weak)
	Reorientation	1,90	

The data were analyzed from twenty-nine students of grade X at SMAN 1 Lubuk Alung. Based on the rating scale, students grade X had not fulfilled yet the indicators in writing recount text based on the rating scale. There were one of them scored 4 (very good), thirteen of them scored 3 (good), fourteen of them scored 2 (weak), and one of them scored 1 (poor). It concluded that not all of students grade X understood how to write a recount text. Because not all of them fulfilled the elements of the generic structure of recount text.

2. Students' grade XI Ability in Writing Recount Text
Table 2
Students' Grade XI Ability in Writing Recount Text Viewed from Generic Structure

No.	Indicators	Scores	Answer of Research Questions
1.	Orientation	3,21	
	Events	2,95	2,74(good)
	Reorientation	2,08	

The data were analysed from twenty-nine students of grade XI at SMAN 1 Lubuk Alung. Based on the rating scale, XI had fulfilled some indicators in writing recount text. There were two of them scored 5

(excellent), fourteen of them scored 3 (good), and seven of them scored 2 (weak). It concluded that most of students grade XI already understood how to produce a recount text.

3. **Comparison of Students' Grade X and Grade XI Ability in Writing Recount Text**

Table 24 Comparison Students' Grade X and Grade XI Ability in Writing Recount Text Viewed from Generic Structure

Indicators	Grade X	Grade XI
Orientation	2,89	3,21
Events	2,65	2,95
Reorientation	1,90	2,08
Answer of Research Question	2,48 (weak)	2,74 (good)

Based on the rating scale, students grade XI got higher category than students grade X. Students grade XI had understood how to write a recount text based on the standard. It proved by students' grade XI score in writing recount text. Almost all of them got 3 (good) score in arranging the text. The student had completed all indicators of generic structure of recount text well. So, it can be concluded that students grade XI at SMAN 1 Lubuk Alung had mastered how to write a recount text.

However, students grade X was lower than grade XI in writing recount text. It means that the students had not understood yet how to write an appropriate recount text based on the standard. It proved by students' grade X score in producing recount text. Students of grade X mostly got 2 (weak) in writing the text. Not all of the student had completed the indicators of generic structure of recount text. So, it can be concluded that students grade X of SMAN 1 Lubuk Alung still not understand how to write a recount text yet.

Based on the finding of this research the ability of students grade XI was higher than students grade X in writing recount text. It was indicated that *the ability of students grade* X were 1 students (3,44%) had very good ability, 13 students (44,82%) had good ability, 14 students (48,3%) had weak ability, and 1 students (3,44%) had poor ability. It was proved most of students grade X had weak ability in writing recount text. Meanwhile students grade XI had good ability. In detail, there were 2 students (8,7%) had excellent ability, 14 students (60,9%) had good ability, and 7 students (30,4%) had weak ability. It can be assumed that most of students grade XI had good ability in writing recount text.

The finding of this research had a different result from Arifaturrochmah (2014). In his finding, the students of grade X were good in writing the generic structure of recount text. However, the findings of this research showed that

grade X students had weak ability in fulfilling the elements of the generic structure of recount text. Next, the research finding from Putri, Tanjung and Ernati (2013) that devided students' ability into three different grade showed that the students' ability to write the generic structure of recount text was moderate. In their finding indicate that 17 students (53,125%) had moderate ability for orientation, 13 students (40,625%) had moderate ability for events, and 20 students (62,5%) had moderate ability for reorientation. On the other hand, the finding of this research showed that the students' grade X of SMAN 1 Lubuk Alung ability in writing recount text were weak.

Furtherrmore, the findings of this research were similar result with Rismawati (2017). In her research showed that mostly of the students got low score than high one. There were four students who got extremely good score, ten students got good score, nine students got fair score and eleven students got low score.

Nevertheles, the researcher found the lack of understanding in writing recount text from both grade X and grade. It was related in writing the events, simple past tense and conjunction. First, the students wrote the events without caring about the coherence in each sentences. It made the sentence not related each other. Also, the studets wrote incomplate ideas in their sentences. Second, most of the students were lack in writing simple past tense (V2) in the event. This erors mostly did by students grade X. Some of students wrote the first form of verb (V1), whereas the form of verb must be used in recount text is the second form of verb (V2). Third, there were lack in writing conjunction. Although the students had written the conjunction in their recount text, there was one thing researcher payed attention that was most of the students repeated the same conjunction. It means that the students did not write various conjunction so that made the recount text toneless.

D. CONCLUSION

Based on the research finding in this research, there are several conclusion that can be drawn. *First,* the students' grade X ability in writing the generic structure of recount text was 2,48 (weak). In detailed, there was 2,89 (good) for orientation; 2,65 (good) for events, and 1,90 (weak) for reorientation. *Second,* the students' grade XI ability in writing the generic structure of recount text was 2,74 (good). In detailed, there was 3,21 (good) for orientation; 2,95 (good) for events, and 2,08 (weak) for reorientation. Then, the ability of students grade XI was higher than students grade X at SMAN 1 Lubuk Alung. The ability of students grade XI was 3 (good). There were two of them scored 5 (excellent), fourteen of them scored 3 (good), and seven of them scored 2 (weak). Meanwhile students' grade X ability was 2 (weak). There were one of them scored 4 (very good), thirteen of them scored 3 (good), fourteen of them scored 2 (weak), and one of them scored 1 (poor). So, it can be concluded that students grade XI had mastered recount text better than students grade X.

Based on the research finding in this research there are several suggestions that researcher offered to the students, teacher, and next researcher who want to conduct similar research. First, it can be suggested to the students at

Senior High School, especially grade X and grade X, need to be more aware in using simple past tense (V2) and conjunctions as the language features of recount text. They need to understand more about those parts. Second, the test was done to find out students' ability in writing recount text without caring students' language ability in writing. Although the recipients can understand the message in the event of the text, there are some mispelled and the sentences are not arranging in good grammar. So, researcher suggested to the teacher should give more examples of a good sentence in writing text, especially in recount text. Third, the suggestion for the next researcher who wants to conduct a research about recount text. The next researcher can do this research on English Department students at collage, especially the one who are in Education major.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Anggraini, D. T., Candra, M., & Subroto, G. (2017). An Analysis of Students' Ability in Writing Descriptive Text at Tenth Grade of SMAN 2 Tanjungpinang. 12.

Arikunto, S. (2010). *Prosedur Penelitian Pendekatan Praktik.* Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.

Cole, F. a. (2015). Effective Strategies for Improving Wrutung Skills of Elementary English Language Learnes. *The Chinese Educational Research and Develompement Association Annual Conference*

Fageeh, A. I. (2014). The Use of Journal Writing and Reading Comprehension Texts during Pre-Writing in Developing EFL Students' Academic Writing. *Studies in Literature and Language*, 1-18.

Gay, L. (1987). *Educational Research, Competences for Analysis and Applications.* Columbus, Ohio: Merril Publicing Company.

Harris, A., Ansyar, M., & Radjab, D. (2014). AN ANALYSIS OF STUDENTS' DIFFICULTIES IN WRITING RECOUNT TEXT AT TENTH GRADE OF SMA N 1 SUNGAI LIMAU. *Journal English Language Teaching (ELT) Volume 2 Nomor 1*, 62.

Hasibuan, A., & Simatupang, T. M. (2018). STUDENTS' ERRORS IN USING LEXICOGRAMMATICAL FEATURES IN WRITING RECOUNT TEXT (A Study at the X Grade Students of SMA Negeri 4 Padangsidimpuan 2016/2017 Academic Year. *ELITE: English and Journal Literature Vol 5, No 1* , 33.

Kassem, H. M. (2017). THE EFFECTIVENESS OF A BLENDED STRATEGY BASED ON CONCEPT MAPPING AND TEXT STRUCTURE IN ENHANCING EFL LEARNERS' WRITING PERFORMANCE. *Journal of studies in education*, 184-212.

Layaaliya, I. N. (2015). Students' Ability in Writing Argumentative Essay at English Teacher Education Department of the State Sunan Ampel Surabaya. 40-46;68

Nurhidayah. (2017). AN ANALYSIS ON THE STUDENTS' ABILITY IN WRITING NARRATIVE TEXT AT GRADE IX MTs ALI IMRON MEDAN. 24-35

Saragih, N. (2014). The Effectiveness of Using Recount Text to Improve Writing Skill For Grade III Students of Kalam Kudus Elementary School 2 Pematangsiantar. *IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science*, 56-14.

Sukma, D. (2015). A STUDY ON WRITING RECOUNT TEXT. *Journal of English Education Vol. 1 No. 1 June 2015*, 66.