



AN ANALYSIS OF CULINARY ART VOCATIONAL STUDENTS' NEEDS IN LEARNING ENGLISH AT THE PUBLIC VOCATIONAL HIGH SCHOOL NUMBER 9 PADANG

Rukmala Dewi¹, Zul Amri²

English Department

Faculty of Languages and Arts

State University of Padang

email: rukmaladewi66@gmail.com

amri_zul@yahoo.com

Abstract

The purpose of this study is to analyze English needs of culinary art students of Vocational High School Number 9 Padang in learning procedure text/recipe. It employed qualitative research method. The subjects of this study were second grade culinary art students of Vocational High School Number 9 Padang. One out of seven classes was chosen to be the sample of this study which consist of 32 students. The data were collected through questionnaires and interview guide. A questionnaire administered to each of the students and an interview was done to an English teacher who teach them. The questionnaire covers three things as the benchmark of students' needs in learning procedure text/recipe in English class. It was analyzed by looking at the mean value of the students' answers. The interview recording was also analyzed to get deeper answer from the teacher. The result of the study showed that the most important activity that should be done in learning procedure text/recipe is reading activity. Meanwhile, the skill that must be mastered by the students in order to perform well in their future carrier was speaking skill.

Key words: Need analysis, Students' needs, Vocational students, Culinary Art Students, English needs, Procedure text, Recipe

INTRODUCTION

English is a compulsory subject taught to the students in Indonesia included vocational high school. Teaching English in vocational high school is based on the syllabus developed by government which is the same as the syllabus used for Indonesian senior high schools. Moreover, text books that were designed by government are also intended to both senior and vocational high school. Those text books contain the general English material, whereas vocational students need English for Specific Purposes. The problems above indicate that there is an incompatibility between what is taught in the vocational high school and what they really need.

¹ English ELTSP of English Department of FBS Universitas Negeri Padang graduated on December 2019

² Lecturer of English Department of FBS Universitas Negeri Padang



Vocational high school is equal to senior high school in Indonesia. It can be seen from several aspects. First, the students who are accepted by both of them are junior high school graduates. Second, both of them are in the same level before university entrance. Third, the students are usually in the same age between 15 until 18 years old. The most important one is that the syllabus they used is same. The only difference is on its purpose. A vocational high school aims to prepare the students to have certain skills that can be applied to work right after graduation. The skills taught are based on the majors that they take. Because of this difference, some subjects taught in vocational high school should be different from the senior high school.

However, according to curriculum 2013, there are six subjects that both of them have such as math, Bahasa Indonesia, religious education, civic, Indonesia history, and English. Even though the subjects are same, the material included must be different considering the goals of the students' skills particularly in English subject. It shows that English in vocational high school is not General English but English for Specific Purposes (ESP) since it is designed to meet the specified needs of the learners. Basturkmen (2008) argued that ESP is understood to be about preparing learners to use English within academic, professional, or workplace environments. Each major in vocational high school aims to graduate the students with specific skills thereby they can perform well in their future carrier. That is why English subject that taught to them must also be specified in order to support those specific skills.

In order to find out the suitably material that should be taught to the culinary art students, needs analysis should be conducted. According to Boroujeni and Fard (2013), need analysis is the procedure of collecting the information. The information is from the students which can be references to what they should learn in English class. There are some information which called as necessities, lacks, and wants of the students. All of them come from the different aspects. Students' necessities are derived from their target situation. The lacks are drawn from what the students have already known, and wants come up because of students' expectation about what they should learn. Additionally, some important information could be obtained from the English teachers who teach them.

Based on the description above, the researcher was interested in conducting a research which entitled "An Analysis of Culinary Art Vocational Students' Needs in Learning English at the Public Vocational High School Number 9 Padang".

RESEARCH METHOD

The research design used in this study is qualitative. Qualitative design is used to describe a phenomenon and provide a definite theory as its result. This study aims to find out what the needs of the culinary art students are by collecting data through questionnaire, analyzing it in mean, and drawing a conclusion based on the data analysis.

The population of this study was the second grade of culinary art students at Vocational High School Number 9 Padang and English teachers who teach them. The students learn English as a compulsory subject. They are taught by an English teachers. A class was taken as the sample of this research. The sample was chosen

by using simple random sampling technique. There were 32 students in the chosen class. Finally, there was an English teacher who was interviewed as another sample of this research.

The instruments were used in the study are questionnaire and interview guide. There was a questionnaire that administered to the students. The questions served in form of close and open questions. The questionnaire covered all three things that used by researcher in describing needs which are student's lacks, wants, and necessities as proposed by Hutchinson and Waters (1989). An interview guide was the second instrument to strengthen the result of the study. The questions which were asked in the interview are some open-ended and close-ended questions about students' and teachers' performances and their needs. The questions in both questionnaire and interview guide are adopted from two other related previous research by Wandut (2018) and Nureffendhi (2013) and adapted to this research.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Research Findings

The Needs Analysis from Questionnaires

The description of the questions in the questionnaires which administered to the students will be described below. There eight sections of the questions delivered to the students. They are the importance of certain activities in English classroom toward learning English especially procedure text lesson, the agreement of some statements related to students' proficiency and procedure text material, the problems that have been faced by the students in the learning process, and the students' expectation of what they should learn in the class. The result of the questionnaire in each section of the students' needs analysis is represented in following section.

Question 1

Question 1 shows the result of importance of the activities in English classroom based on the students' perception. It is provided in the following table (**table 3.1**).

Table 3.1 The Importance of English Activities

| No | Activity | SP/5 | P/4 | C/3 | KP/2 | TP/1 | N | Total | Mean |
|----|-----------|------|-----|-----|------|------|----|-------|------|
| 1 | Reading | 12 | 18 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 32 | 137 | 4,3 |
| 2 | Writing | 8 | 20 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 32 | 130 | 4,1 |
| 3 | Listening | 17 | 9 | 5 | 1 | 0 | 32 | 138 | 4,3 |
| 4 | Speaking | 15 | 7 | 8 | 2 | 0 | 32 | 131 | 4,1 |

The highest score as the most important activities in English classroom are reading and listening. The second activities that are considered important are writing as well as speaking in the same position. Nevertheless, the data shows that all those activities are important according to the students.

Question 2

In order to provide the activities that meet the needs of the culinary students, the data about the importance of those activities for the future jobs of the students should be analyzed. Question 2 shows the results of importance of following

activities in English classroom toward their future job in culinary program. They are provided in following table (table 3.2).

Table 3.2 The Importance of English Activity for Future Carrier

| No | Activity | SP/5 | P/4 | C/3 | KP/2 | TP/1 | N | Total | Mean |
|----|--|------|-----|-----|------|------|----|-------|------|
| 1 | Reading English text | 11 | 16 | 4 | 1 | 0 | 32 | 133 | 4,1 |
| 2 | Writing English Text | 6 | 17 | 8 | 1 | 0 | 32 | 124 | 3,9 |
| 3 | Listening to English dialogue/ monologue | 15 | 10 | 5 | 2 | 0 | 32 | 134 | 4,2 |
| 4 | Speaking in English | 17 | 7 | 7 | 1 | 0 | 32 | 136 | 4,3 |

Even though the students put speaking as the second most important activity in English classroom in general, but it is in the first level when it deals with their future jobs. The second most important activity is listening to English monologue/dialogue. It is followed by reading English text in the third position, and writing English text is in the last level, but still it is considered important enough to support their carrier later.

Question 3

Since the focus of this research is to analyze needs of the students in learning procedure text in English classroom, question 3 must be a question that should answered by the students. Question 3 shows the result of importance of following activities in learning procedure text/recipe in English classroom. It is provided in the following table (table 3.3).

Table 3.3 The Importance of English Activity in Learning Procedure Text/Recipe

| No | Activity | SP/5 | P/4 | C/3 | KP/2 | TP/1 | N | Total | Mean |
|----|-----------|------|-----|-----|------|------|----|-------|------|
| 1 | Reading | 19 | 13 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 32 | 147 | 4,6 |
| 2 | Writing | 9 | 18 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 32 | 132 | 4,1 |
| 3 | Listening | 18 | 11 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 32 | 143 | 4,5 |
| 4 | Speaking | 15 | 9 | 6 | 2 | 0 | 32 | 133 | 4,1 |

The table above shows that in learning procedure text/recipe in English classroom, the highest score as the most important activity according to the students is reading. The second activity that is considered important is listening. It is followed by writing and speaking activities in the same level since the mean of those two activities is equal.

Question 4

Question 4 gives more information about what the specific yet important activities when learning procedure text in the class are. Its result shows in the following table (table 3.4).

Table 3.4 The Importance of Specific English Activity in Learning Procedure Text/Recipe

| No | Activity | SP/5 | P/4 | C/3 | KP/2 | TP/1 | N | Total | Mean |
|----|---|------|-----|-----|------|------|----|-------|------|
| 1 | Listening to dialogue of recipe | 20 | 9 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 32 | 139 | 4,3 |
| 2 | Writing English recipe | 13 | 15 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 32 | 129 | 4,0 |
| 3 | Reading and comprehending recipe and answer related questions | 15 | 14 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 32 | 140 | 4,4 |
| 4 | Speaking in front of the class or with classmates about recipe. | 7 | 12 | 12 | 0 | 1 | 32 | 120 | 3,7 |

The highest score as the most important activities in learning procedure text/recipe according to the students is reading and comprehending a recipe and answer related questions. It is in line with the previous table (table 4.3) where shows reading as the most important activity. As table 4.3 informed that listening is the second most important activity, this table say so. Listening to the dialogue of recipe gets the second highest score. The third important activity comes to writing English recipe, and the last one is speaking in front of the class or with classmates about recipe.

Question 5

Besides looking at how important an activity is in English classroom especially when learning procedure text, it is also important to know students' proficiency. Level of knowledge of the students must be a consideration to find out their needs. Question 5 shows how agree the students' are about the following statements based on their capability. The result of this table will inform the lacks of the students.

Table 3.5 Students' Proficiency

| No | Statement | SS/5 | S/4 | N/3 | TS/2 | STT/1 | N | Total | Mean |
|----|--|------|-----|-----|------|-------|----|-------|------|
| 1 | I could comprehend recipe very well and fast. | 5 | 20 | 6 | 1 | 0 | 32 | 125 | 3,9 |
| 2 | I know many vocabularies about culinary (the foods and the | 3 | 15 | 14 | 0 | 0 | 32 | 117 | 3,6 |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|--|---|----|----|---|---|----|-----|-----|
| | equipment) | | | | | | | | |
| 3 | I comprehend very well imperative sentences in recipe. | 4 | 16 | 10 | 2 | 0 | 32 | 118 | 3,7 |
| 4 | I'm able to arrange a good and coherent recipe. | 7 | 9 | 16 | 0 | 0 | 32 | 119 | 3,7 |
| 5 | I'm able to give instructions of making foods in English. | 4 | 12 | 11 | 5 | 0 | 32 | 111 | 3,5 |
| 6 | I'm able to talk with teacher and friends about recipe in English. | 6 | 1 | 16 | 9 | 0 | 32 | 100 | 3,1 |

From the table above, it can conclude that the lower of value of mean, the more lacks are there. The most lacks are shown in the speaking activity in the sixth statement. The second most lacks according to the students appears in giving English instructions. The lacks of vocabulary is in the third position. Next, the comprehension of imperative sentences and arranging the recipe text show less problems according to the students. Finally most of the students agree that they could understand the recipe well and fast, even though the score is still not reach score 4.

Question 6

Question 6 shows the result of how agree the students of the following statements.

Table 3.6 Students' Necessities

| No | Statement | SS/5 | S/4 | N/3 | TS/2 | STT/1 | N | Total | Mean |
|----|---|------|-----|-----|------|-------|----|-------|------|
| 1 | English recipe text is important to be comprehended | 18 | 10 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 32 | 141 | 4,4 |
| 2 | It's important to understand many vocabularies | 11 | 15 | 4 | 1 | 0 | 32 | 129 | 4,0 |

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|----|----|---|---|----|-----|-----|
| | about culinary. | | | | | | | | |
| 3 | It's important to understand imperative sentences in comprehending recipe text. | 4 | 17 | 10 | 1 | 0 | 32 | 120 | 3,7 |
| 4 | It's important to be able to write English recipe. | 9 | 14 | 7 | 1 | 1 | 32 | 125 | 3,9 |

The result of the data in the table above helps to determine what material of procedure text/recipe that must be given to the students. It shows that the students very agree that English recipe is important to be comprehended. It really describe them as the culinary students. Giving more vocabularies about culinary is also very important according to the students. They also agree that being able to write recipe is important for them. Lastly, they do think that knowing imperative sentences in order to more comprehend the recipe is also important. It can conclude that all the procedure text materials stated above is important to be taught in the class.

Question 7

In this section the problems that appear when students learn procedure text in the class will be shown. Those problems are grouped in four different activities (speaking, writing, reading, and listening). They will be provided in the following table (table 3.7).

Table 3.7 The Students' Problems

| No | Problems | Number of Students |
|--|---|--------------------|
| In speaking activity, the problem that I face when learning procedure text is.... | | |
| 1 | Lacks of vocabulary | 7 |
| 2 | Not confident | 12 |
| 3 | Sentence structure | 3 |
| 4 | Not able to pronounce certain words | 1 |
| 5 | Too long text | 5 |
| 6 | Not able to interpret the text given | 1 |
| In writing activity, the problem that I face when learning procedure text is.... | | |
| 7 | Lacks of vocabulary | 11 |
| 8 | Sentence structure | 8 |
| In reading activity, the problem that I face when learning procedure text is.... | | |
| 9 | Too long sentences/text | 5 |
| 10 | Lacks of vocabulary | 3 |
| 11 | Not able to pronounce certain words | 3 |
| 12 | Not able to interpret the meaning of the text | 3 |
| In listening activity, the problem that I face when learning procedure text is.... | | |
| 13 | Too fast audio | 8 |

| | | |
|----|-----------------------------|---|
| 14 | Lacks of vocabulary | 5 |
| 15 | Not focus | 4 |
| 16 | Not able to get the meaning | 3 |

There are some problems that faced by the students when learning procedure text in the class. The table above shows all the problems in the certain activity. In speaking activity, the most problems that is felt by them is being not confident. They are not confident enough to speak in English in the the learning process. The second most problem problem appears because of the lacks of vocabulary. The students does not have enough English words to convey their intention.

Too long text is also being a problem that face by the students that makes them do not want to speak in English. The other problems are their ignorance of sentence structure, incapacity to interpret the meaning of what they listen to or read, and the obstacles in pronouncing the words.

In writing activity, students think that the lacks of vocabulary becomes the main problem. The sentence structure is also a problem that face them when they want to write English text.

Too long sentences in the given is the most problem that appear in reading activity. The lacks of vocabulary and not being able to pronounce words and interpret the meaning of the text are also perceived by the students as the problems in reading activity in the class.

Meanwhile, in listening activity, the most problems felt by the students is too fast audio. It makes them hard to get what the audio talk about. The lacks of vocabulary again becomes a problem in this activity. Two other problem in listening activity according to the students are not focus and not able to interpret the meaning because of the above three problems.

From all four activities above, it can conclude that the problem that always arises is the lacks of vocabulary. It means that give more vocabulary will help them to improve their activities in the class.

Question 8

The collected data shows the wants of the students. What they expect they learn in English classroom when learning procedure text. It provides in the table below (table 3.8).

Table 3.8 The Students' Wants

| No | Statements | Number of Students |
|---------------------------------|---|--------------------|
| In reading activity, I want to: | | |
| 1 | Be able to read the recipe fluently | 20 |
| 2 | Read vocabularies which relate with culinary | 4 |
| 3 | Read shorter text to make it easy to remember | 2 |
| 4 | Read text while listening to audio | 1 |
| 5 | Read a text with pictures in it | 4 |
| 6 | Read the dialogue | 1 |
| In writing activity, I want to: | | |
| 7 | Write my own recipe | 7 |
| 8 | Learn new vocabularies | 8 |

| | | |
|-----------------------------------|---|----|
| 9 | Write with my own English which simpler and easier | 15 |
| 10 | Write a dialogue | 2 |
| In listening activity, I want to: | | |
| 11 | Be focus to listen to the audio | 23 |
| 12 | Listen more to the dialogue or monologue about culinary | 7 |
| 13 | Listen to vocabulary which relate with culinary | 2 |
| In speaking activity, I want to: | | |
| 14 | Have dialogue with friends | 6 |
| 15 | Speak about culinary | 3 |
| 16 | Talk to friend with my style of English | 1 |
| 17 | Memories more new vocabularies | 4 |
| 18 | Speak fluently in order to make the meaning clear | 17 |
| 19 | Do role play in English | 1 |

In reading activity, the students prefer to be able to read and understand the recipe. Some of them also want to read some new vocabularies about culinary. Reading the shorter text, reading a text while listening to its audio, reading a recipe with pictures in it, and reading dialogue are also wishes of the students in learning process.

In writing activity, many of the students want to write recipe with their own words which is simpler and easier to understand. Some of them also want to make their own recipe in English. Others think that learning new vocabularies will help them to write in English. Finally some of them want to write a dialogue about recipe in the class.

In listening activity, the students want to be more focus in listening to an audio. They want to listen to dialogue or monologue about culinary things. They also want to get and learn new vocabularies through the audio.

In speaking activity, the students prefer to be more fluent in speaking English in order to convey the meaning clearly. They want to have dialogue with their friends in the class. Talking about culinary with their own communication style and words. Doing role play and memorizing more new words are also two things that they want do in speaking activity in the class.

The Needs Analysis from Interview

According to the English teacher who teach the second grade of culinary art students in Vocational High School number 9 Padang, students are enthusiast in learning procedural text/recipe in English class. Students are most interested in writing and speaking activities. The teacher thinks the most important skill that must be mastered by her students in procedural text lesson is speaking skill. It is because this skill is very useful in their internship and hopefully in their future jobs later. That is why the need to improve their speaking skill by learning more vocabulary about culinary and practice a lot since their speaking ability level is still low to medium. However, in learning procedure text/recipe, the teacher thinks that the most important skill is reading since they need to comprehend the text given by

answering some related questions. After that, they will be able to practice what they got in procedure text lesson.

Mastering procedure text/recipe is crucial for culinary students. In order to do so, students should understand the imperative sentences which are dominant in this kind of text. Other than that, students must rich of the vocabulary which related with culinary things. However, the students' proficiency in those two material are still in the medium level even their vocabulary is still poor. The teacher thinks that they need to enrich their vocabulary since it will help them a lot in comprehending any kinds of recipe.

Discussion

From the data analysis above, it found that the most important activity in learning procedure text/recipe in the English class is speaking. Both teacher and students agree that speaking skill must be mastered by culinary students since it will help them a lot in their future carrier.

However, when it comes to procedure text/recipe lesson, both of teacher and students prefer reading activity as the most important activity that should be done in the class. One of reading activities which interest the students is comprehending recipe and answer the related questions.

The students are still lacks of vocabulary about culinary. This is seen to be the main problem in learning procedure text/recipe. This problem always appears in four activities in the class (reading, speaking, listening, and writing). That is why the students wants to enrich their vocabulary through four English activities in the class. It is one of the solutions that both of the teacher and the students want to do.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

Conclusion

The goal of the study is to find out the needs of second grade culinary art students of vocational high school in learning procedure text/recipe in the class since the curriculum only provides General English for them. In answering the research question the researcher figures out the theories in chapter 2 and use needs analysis methodology which proposed by Hutchinson and Waters (1989).

According to Hutchinson and Waters (1989), based on the target needs of the students, there are three things that were explored from the students in analyzing their needs. They are their necessities, lacks, and wants.

The result of this study shows that in learning procedure text, the most important activity in English classroom that students need is reading activity. Meanwhile, in order to perform well in their future carrier, they need speaking skill as the most crucial one to be mastered. Moreover, they want and have to enrich more culinary vocabulary. That is why they expect in any kinds of activities in the class, they should get any new words about culinary.

Suggestions

There are some suggestions for the English teachers who teach culinary students in vocational high school from the result of this study. In teaching procedure text/recipe, teachers should concern more about what the students' needs

in order to perform well in the class as well as in their future carrier. What skill that must be mastered by the students and what English activities should be done in the class in order to support their other skill are the two main focuses.

From this study the most important skill is speaking and reading. That is why, it is necessary for the teachers to create an activity that can support those skills. The researcher suggests the teachers to choose material of procedure text or recipe that will be applied in their work as culinary students. After choosing the right material, design the activities that will help them in their performance as the prospective workers in industry. The culinary English teachers also should give new culinary vocabularies to the students in every meeting in the class as the students expect.

Finally, since this study already talked about the students needs in learning procedure text/recipe, the researcher suggests the next further researcher to focus on other topic in English subject.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Basturkmen, H. (2008). *Ideas and Options in English for Specific Purposes*. London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers
- Boroujeni, S.A., & Fard, F.M. (2013). A Needs Analysis of English for Specific Purposes (ESP) Course for Adoption of Communicative Language Teaching (A case of Iranian first-year students of educational administration). *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science Invention*, 2(6), 35-44.
- Hutchinson, T. & Waters, A. (1989). *English for Specific Purposes: A Learning centered approach*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Nureffendhi, D. (2013). *Developing English Learning Materials for Grade Ten Students of Culinary Arts Study Programme at SMK Muhammadiyah Wonosari in Academic Year 2012-2013*. Yogyakarta State University, Indonesia.
- Wandut, W.K. (2018). *A Culinary English Course Book for Vocational High School Students*. (Doctoral dissertation). Sanata Dharma University, Yogyakarta, Indonesia.