

STUDENTS' ABILITY AND PROBLEMS IN WRITING REVIEW TEXT AT GRADE XII SMAN 4 KERINCI

Anamaryanti, Hermawati Syarif, Yenni Rozimela
Language Education Program, State University of Padang
Anamaryanti007@gmail.com

Abstrak: *Artikel ini ditulis untuk mendeskripsikan penelitian tentang kemampuan siswa dalam menulis review text, masalah-masalah yang dihadapi siswa dalam menulis review text dan penyebab masalah tersebut. Data penelitian ini adalah hasil tulisan siswa dan hasil wawancara dengan siswa. Hasil penelitian deskriptif ini menunjukkan bahwa kemampuan siswa dalam menulis review cukup. Meskipun nilai rata-rata siswa dikategorikan cukup, siswa juga menemukan masalah dalam menulis review text. Masalah-masalah mereka berhubungan dengan kosa kata, tata bahasa, struktur umum, mengorganisasikan ide dan ejaan serta tanda baca. Temuan juga menunjukkan bahwa penyebab masalah tersebut adalah interferensi bahasa pertama, bahasa sasaran yang begitu sulit, dan kurangnya pengetahuan siswa tentang komponen dalam menulis review text.*

Keywords : *writing ability, writing problems, review text*

Introduction

Writing is a way to transfer ideas or opinion into written form. Through writing, the learners can share ideas, opinion or feeling to others. As stated by Liu (2001:38), writing is a way of communicating a message to a reader for a purpose. The purpose is to express ideas or opinion and to provide information. It is supported by O'Malley and Lorraine (1995: 136), writing is a personal act in which the writer expresses the idea through written form. It means that writing is a way to express ideas or opinion through paper.

In addition, Babala (2012:7) states that writing is considered as a difficult language skill which must be learned by the learners to convey their ideas. It is supported by Oshima and Hogue (1993:3), writing is not easy to be conducted, since the students should have ability in writing in order to be able to express

the idea well. It means that the students should be able to state the idea effectively in order to get good ability in writing. Therefore, writing is very important to be taught to the students in order to produce effective and interesting composition.

Since writing is important to be taught, there are some types of text which are stated for teaching writing at grade XII, one of them is review text. Review text is a text that has the purpose to criticize or evaluate an art work or event for a public audience (Sudarwati and Grace, 2006: 190). The text is also used to criticize the events or art works for the reader or listener, such as movies, shows, competitions, etc. It comprises four main organizations; orientation (identifying the name of the creative work which is the subject of the review, what kind of work it is, and its author), interpretative recount (providing the

summary of an art work), evaluation (providing an evaluation of the work and/or its performance or production), and evaluative summation (stating the appraisal of the art work being criticized). Its characteristics can be seen through its language features. The text focuses on using modals, noun phrases, compound and complex sentences, simple present tense and simple past tense.

Related to the students' writing in review text, there are some common problems faced by the students. Bahri and Sugeng (2009: 15) statesome common problems faced by the students in writing review text. First is grammatical problems in which the students can't use tenses correctly. Second is the problem related to organizing idea in which the students can't organize the idea well. Third is the problem in paragraph organization in which the students get confused in writing orientation and interpretative recount. The last one is the problem in vocabulary in which the students use unappropriate words.

The problems faced by the students in writing review text was caused by some factors;the factors areinterference of first language, the complexity of the target language and lack of knowledge about writing components (Saadiyah, 2009: 21).

Interference is derivation form of the language norm which occurs in the speech of bilingual as the result of familiarity with more than one. Liu (2001: 35) states that interference can be said as the negative transfer. Liu explains that if the use of the first language benefits the learning tasks of the second language called positive

transfer, however, if it distrupts the performance of the second language task it is called interference as the negative transfer.

Certain aspects in English are difficult for some learners. It may be caused by the rules of their native language which are quite different from English and even more complex than their native language.The learners don't master the English structure well and are not able to use rules of the components and elements of second language.

Maros (2007:215) says second language learning is the process that is clearly not unlike first language learning in its trial and errors nature. It means that the second language learning is different from first language learning. Furthermore, Liu (2001:36) states the learners get difficulty in writing because they use different forms from first language and the second language in delivering their ideas, feelings or messages, so they need to have considerable amount of time to be able to master the target language well. They need to know the rules of the second language.

The learners should have the knowledge about the components of writing. If the learners have less knowledge about the components of writing, they can't express ideas and provide information well to the readers (Saadiyah, 2009:23). Because of less knowledge about the components of writing, the learners will face some problems in writing.

Therefore, the components of writing is very important to be taught to the students in order to get good writing.

Related to components of writing, there are some theories from

experts. According to Harris (1974:68-69) there are five general components of writing, they are; content, form (the organization of the content), grammar, style (the choice of structures and lexical items to give a particular tone or flavor to the writing), and mechanics.

In addition, Jacob, et.al (1981:90) also divide writing into five components. However the components do not include style as one of writing components. Below are components of writing according to Jacob; content, organization, vocabulary, language use, and mechanics.

In addition, Hughes (2003:100-102) and Starkey (2004:14) state five components of writing. The components are: organizing idea, grammar/ language use, vocabulary, mechanics and organization/ generic structure.

From the researcher's observation, the students faced some problems in writing review text. First, the students have lack of motivation to write review text. When then teacher asked them to write, they just kept silent, and they did not know what they wanted to write. That's why, if there was a writing task, some of students liked cheating and need extra time to finish it. Second, the students did not use a good strategy when they were writing review text. As an example, they didn't write the draft and they didn't write the question related to what they wanted to write. Third, the students had less of knowlegde about components of review text.

Based on the problems above, the researcher wants to know the students' ability in writing review text, the students' problems in

writing review text and the causes of the students' problems in writing review text.

Based on those explanations, the purposes of the research are:

1. to explain the students ability in writing review text at grade XII SMAN 4 Kerinci.
2. to explain the students' problems in writing a review text at grade XII SMAN 4 Kerinci.
3. to explain the causes of the students' problems in writing review text at grade XII SMAN 4 Kerinci?

Method of the Research

This research was conducted by using descriptive research because the researcher investigated the phenomena about the students' ability in writing a review text, the students' problems and the causes of the problems. The source of the data in this research was the students of class XII IPA in SMAN 4 Kerinci in the year 2013/ 2014. They consisted of three classes (IPA 1, IPA 2 and IPA 3). The number of the students were 102 students. All of the classes were treated similarly in learning English. They had the same teacher and same materials.

The data were collected from students through writing test and interview. The data were analyzed to know the students' ability in writing review text, the problems and the causes of the problems.

Findings and Discussion

Findings

1. The students' ability in writing review text

The students' ability in writing review text was different

from each indicator. It can be seen from the following table.

Table 1: The students' score on writing review text

No	Indicators	Average score
1.	Vocabulary	61.72
2.	Grammar	58.9
3.	Generic structure	67.1
4.	Organizing idea	72.28
5.	Mechanic	71.2

Table 1 shows the students' ability in writing review text for each indicator. Average score of the students' ability in writing review text related to vocabulary was 61.72 in the range score of 56-65. It means that the students' ability in writing review text related to vocabulary was categorized at fair. The students' score in grammar was 58.9 in the range score 56-65. It means that the students' ability in writing review text related to grammar was categorized at fair. Next, the students' score in generic structure was 67.1 in the range score 66-79. It means that the students' ability in writing review text related to generic structure was categorized at good. Then, the students' score in organizing idea in writing review text was 72.28 in the range score 66-79. It means that the students' ability in writing review text related to organizing idea was categorized at good. The last one, the students' score in mechanic was 71.2 in the range score 66-79. It means that the students' ability in writing review text related to mechanic was categorized at good.

From the finding above, it could be concluded that the lowest score was grammar which was 58.9. It means that the students had most problems in grammar when they wrote review text. The highest average score was organizing idea which was 72.28. It means that the students got least problems in organizing idea when they wrote review text.

2. The students' problems in writing review text.

a. The students' problems in writing review text related to vocabulary.

The students' problems in vocabulary can be described in the following table.

Table 2. The students' problems in writing review text related to vocabulary

The students' problems in vocabulary	Number of the students	Number of the errors	Percentage
Diction	12	17	19.76 %
Adverb	15	20	23.26 %
Preposition	13	19	22.03 %
Pronouns	17	34	39.53 %
Total		89	100 %

Table 2 shows the students' errors in vocabulary for each indicator. s 86. From all the

indicators, the use of pronouns was the most dominant problems faced by the students with the number of errors 34 from 17 different students (39.53%). It was followed by adverb with the frequency was 20 errors from 15 different students (23.26%). Next, the use of preposition had numbers of errors 19 from 13 different students (22.03%). The least problems was diction with the frequency was 17 errors from 12 different students (19.76%).

b. Students' grammar problem in writing a review text

Table 3. The students' problems in writing review text related to grammar

The students' problems in grammar	Number of the students	Number of the errors	Percentage
Modal	16	37	17.9 %
Noun phrase	19	46	22.3 %
Compound and complex sentence	19	38	18.45 %
Simple present	18	38	18.45 %
Simple past	19	48	23.3 %
Total		219	100 %

Table 3 shows the students' errors in grammar for each indicator. From all the indicators, the use of simple past was the most dominant problems faced by the students with the number of errors 48 from 25

different students (23.3%). It was followed by noun phrase with the frequency was 46 errors from 19 different students (22.3%). Next, it was followed by compound and complex sentence with the frequency 38 errors from 19 different students (18.45%) and simple present with the frequency 38 from 18 different students (18.45%). The least problems faced by the students in writing review text related to grammar was modal with the frequency 37 errors from 16 different students (17.9%).

c. The students' problems in writing review text related to generic structure

Table 4. The students' problems in writing review text related to generic structure

The students' difficulties in generic structure	Number of the students	Number of the errors	Percentage
Incomplete generic structure	15	21	44.7
Combination orientation and interpretative recount	9	9	19.1%
Combination interpretative recount and evaluation	9	9	19.1%
Combination interpretative recount and evaluation	8	8	17%
Total		47	100 %

Table 4 shows the students' errors in generic structure for each indicator. Based on the data, the total of the students' errors in generic structure was 47. From all the indicators, incomplete generic structure was the most dominant problems faced by the students with

the number of errors 21 from 15 different students (44.7%). It was followed by combination of orientation and evaluation, and the combination of interpretative recount and evaluation with the same frequency 9 errors from 9 different students (19.1%). The least problems was combination orientation and evaluation with the frequency was 8 errors from 2 different students (17%).s

d. The students' problems in writing review text related to organizing idea

Table 5. The students' problems in writing review text related to organizing idea.

The students' problems in organizing idea	Number of the students	Number of the errors	Percentage
Incomplete idea	11	13	43.3%
Paragraph has no idea	8	11	36.7%
Paragraph has more than one idea	6	6	20%
Total		30	100 %

Table 5 shows the students' problems in organizing idea. The most dominant errors made by the students in organizing idea was about incomplete idea with the number of errors 13 from 11 different students (43.3%). Then, it was followed by paragraph that had more than one idea with the number of errors 11

from 8 different students (36.7%). It was followed by paragraph that had no idea with the frequency was 6 errors from 6 different students (20%).

e. The students' problems in writing review text.

Table 6. The students' problems in writing review text related to mechanic

The students' problems in mechanic	Number of the students	Number of the errors	Percentage
Spelling	17	34	57.6%
Punctuation	16	25	42.4%
Total		59	100 %

Table 6 shows the students' errors in mechanic (spelling and punctuation). The most dominant problems faced by the students in mechanic was spelling with the number of errors 34 from 17 different students (57.6%). It was followed by punctuation with the frequency was 25 errors from 16 different students (42.4%).

Based on the explanation above, it could be concluded that the students had problems in writing review text. Most of them had problems in vocabulary, grammar, generic structure, organizing idea and mechanic. The students' problems in writing review text can be described in the following table.

Table 7. The students' problems in writing review text

The students' problems	Number of the errors	Percentage
Vocabulary	86	20.9%
Grammar	206	48.13 %
Generic structure	47	11 %
Organizing idea	30	7.09 %
Mechanic	59	13.78%
Total	428	100 %

Table 7 shows the students' errors in writing review text for each indicator. From all the indicators, the use of grammar was the dominant problems faced by the students with the number of errors 206 of 428 errors (48.13%). The least problem was organizing idea with the frequency 30 errors of 428 errors (7.09%).

3. The causes of the students' problems in writing review text

Table 8. The causes of the students' problems in writing review Text.

No	The Causes of the Students' problems	Number of the students	Percentage
1.	Interference of first language	20	80%
2.	Complexity of the target language	18	72%
3.	Lack of knowledge about writing	15	60%

	componen ts		
--	----------------	--	--

Table 8 shows that 20 students from 25 students (80%) said that they got interference from their first language when they wrote review text. It shows that the main cause of the students' problems in writing review text was the interference of first language. Then, the table also showed that 18 students from 25 students (72%) said the English was complicated. It meant that the second cause of the students' problems in writing review text was the complexity of the target language. Finally, the least cause of the students' problems in writing review text was lack of knowledge about writing components. It was proved by 15 students from 25 students (60%) stated that they didn't know the components of writing review text and it was not important for them at all.

Discussion

This research shows the students' ability in writing review text. The first ability of the students in writing review text was vocabulary. In writing a review text, the students had to be able to choose the appropriate vocabulary or accurate words to express idea. If the students didn't use appropriate words in their writings, it was problems for readers to catch their idea. It was very hard to understand their writings.

Related to vocabulary, the students' ability in writing review text was fair. The students' ability in vocabulary was fair because the students didn't use accurate word when they wrote review text. So, their writings was rather hard to be understood. As stated by Olson

(2007:21), one of the best ways to accurately convey the writers' ideas in their writing is to choose the right vocabulary.

The second ability of the students in writing review text was grammar. In writing a review text, the students had to be able to use grammar appropriately. If the students could not use grammar correctly, they couldn't express their ideas well. Related to grammar, the students' ability in writing review text was fair. The students' ability in grammar was fair because some of the students couldn't use grammar correctly. The students tended to ignore the rule of the grammar. In fact, grammar is important. Grammar is the rules for forming acceptable utterances of the language (Gleason 1998:71).

The third ability of the students' in writing review text was generic structure. The students' ability in writing review text related to generic structure was fair. The students' ability in writing review text related to generic structure was fair because the students made some errors in the components of generic structure. They tended to combine orientation, interpretative recount and evaluation. Actually, generic structure of review text should be written well without combining the components of generic structure. As stated by According to Pedler (2001), review texts well-organized generic structure, which covers on four main points; orientation, interpretative recount, evaluation and evaluative summation.

The fourth one was the students' ability in writing review text related to organizing idea. Idea is the most important component of writing. The writers should be able to

organize the ideas well. Related to organizing idea, the students' ability in writing review text was good. The students' ability in organizing idea was good because most of the students could organize the idea well. Just a few of the students made errors in organizing idea. As stated by Starkey (2004:2), well organization of ideas will benefit the writers and readers. From the finding, the students could express their idea in the right way since they can convey their messages successfully by using good organization.

The last component of writing was mechanic. Here, mechanic focused on spelling and punctuation. Related to mechanic, the students' ability in writing review text was good. The students' ability in mechanic was good because most of the students didn't made errors in spelling and punctuation. Just a few of the students made errors on spelling and punctuation. If the students didn't make misspelling and punctuation, they could improve the quality of their writing. As stated by Starkey (2004: 48), if the writers are demanded not to make misspelling in their writing, it contributes the quality of the writing.

In summary, it can be stated that the students' ability in writing review text at grade XII SMAN 4 Kerinci was fair.

Related to the students' problems in writing review text, the first problem was vocabulary. They were diction, adverb, preposition and pronoun. The students got problems in vocabulary because they didn't use appropriate words. In fact, the students had to choose the right words. Because of that, the readers

couldn't catch the ideas shared. When appropriate words are used, they could affect the readers' understanding toward the ideas which were conveyed by the writers. Good word choice (diction) does not mean that the writers use a lot of words, fancy and unusual words. However, it is to use the right words to say the right things in the right way (Peha, 2004:12). Because the students didn't use the appropriate words, of course they got problems in vocabulary when wrote review text.

The second problem that found in this research was grammar. The students got problems in grammar because they didn't not use grammar correctly. The students' grammar problems were in using modal, noun phrase, compound and complex sentence, simple present and simple past. The students got problems in grammar because they tended to ignore the rule of the grammar. In fact, grammar is important. Grammar is the rules for forming acceptable utterances of the language (Gleason 1998:71).

Third, the students' problem in writing review text was related to generic structure. The students' problems in generic structure were incomplete generic structure, combination orientation and evaluation, and combination of interpretative recount and evaluation. The students got problems in generic structure because they didn't follow the ways of writing generic structure well. Because the students didn't use generic structure well, of course they faced some problems in writing review text. It was supported by Bahri and Sugeng (2009: 6), they say that the common problems faced by

the students in writing review text is in using generic structure. It seemed that some of the students were aware of generic structure of review text namely orientation, interpretative recount, evaluation and evaluative summation. But they did not comprehend how to make evaluation and interpretative recount, evaluation and evaluative summation. They didn't know what should be involved in evaluation and interpretative recount, evaluation and evaluative summation.

Fourth, the students got problems in organizing the idea. In organizing idea, the students problems were incomplete idea and paragraph that had more than one idea. The students got problems in organizing idea because some of the students could not organize the idea well. As stated by Starkey (2004:2), well organization of ideas will benefit the writers and readers. If the students could not express their idea in the right way, they could not convey their messages successfully.

The fifth problem that found in this research was mechanics. The students' problems in mechanics were spelling and punctuation. The students got problems in mechanic because the students got confused in writing spelling of a word and they also got problems in using punctuation especially for using apostrophe and direct quotation. The students made misspelling and punctuation, so they couldn't improve the quality of their writing. As stated by Starkey (2004: 48), if the writers are demanded not to make misspelling in their writing, it contributes the quality of the writing.

Based on the discussion above, it could be stated that the

students' problems of writing review text in class XII IPA SMAN 4 Kerinci are vocabulary, grammar, generic structure, organizing idea and mechanic.

Concerning the causes of the students' problems in writing review text, there were three indicators used. Those indicators were interference of first language, the complexity of the target language, and lack of knowledge about writing components.

First is interference of first language. Based on the finding, the students said that they thought words in Indonesian language first then translate into English. So, interference of first language was one cause of the students' problems in writing review text. As stated by Grenville (2002: 84), interference of first language causes the students get problems in writing.

Second is complexity of target language. Based on the interview, the students said that they got problems in writing review text because they didn't know the complex rules of English. Because of the complexity of English, the students didn't master the English structure well and they got problems in writing review text. It is supported by Liu (2001:36), the learners get difficulty in writing because they use different forms from first language and the second language in delivering their ideas, feelings or messages so they need to considerable amount of time to be able to master the target language well. They need to know the rules of the second language.

Third is lack of knowledge about writing components. Some

components of writing that need to be mastered were generic structure, grammar, organizing idea, mechanics and vocabulary. Without understanding the components, the students could't produce a good review text. Based on the interview, the students said that they didn't know the components of writing review text well. Because the students didn't know the components of the review text well, as the effect they got problems in writing review text. It is supported by (Saadiyah, 2009:23), he states that if the learners have less knowledge about the components of writing, they can't express ideas and provide information well to the readers.

Conclusion

Based on the data analysis, the students' ability in writing review text at grade XII IPA SMAN 4 Kerinci was categorized at fair. It was supported from the average score that the students got (64.8) in the range score of 56-65.

In writing review text the students got problems in using vocabulary, grammar, generic structure, organizing idea and mechanics. The students' problems in vocabulary were in diction, adverb, preposition, and pronoun. The students' problems in grammar were in using modal, noun phrase, compound and complex sentence, simple present and simple past. The students' problems in generic structure were combination of orientation, interpretative recount and evaluation. In organizing idea, the students' problems were paragraph that had incomplete idea and paragraph that had more than one idea. The students' problems in

mechanics were in using spelling and punctuation.

The students' problems in writing review text were caused by some factors, they are: interference of first language, complexity of target language and lack of knowledge about writing components.

Suggestion

1. The students should master the rules of English to avoid the interference of their language, and to know the rules for the complexity of English.
2. The English teachers are suggested to explain the writing components of review text by using good strategy in order to get the students' understanding about the writing components of review text.

Note: This article was written from the writer's thesis at Pasca Sarjana State University of Padang supervised by Prof. Dr. Hermawati Syarif, M.Hum and Dra. Yenni Rozimela, M.Ed., Ph.D.

REFERENCES

- Bahri, Saiful and Sugeng, Bambang. 2009. *Problems in Writing Review Text of the Class XII in SMAN 1 Selong East Lombok West Nusa Tenggara in the School Year 2008/2009*. East Lombok: The State Islamic University of Lombok.(Unpublished Thesis).
- Babala, H.2012. *Effects of Process-Genre Based Approach on the*

- Written English Performance of Computer Science Students in a Nigerian Polytechnic. *Journal of Education and Practice*. 3 (6).1-30.
- Gleason, B.J and Ratner, B.N. (Ed). 1998. *Psycholinguistics*.Orlando: Harcourt Brace College Publisher.
- Grenville, Kate. 2002. *Writing from Start to Finish: A Six-Step Guide*. Sidney: Griffffin Press.
- Harris, David P. 1974. *Testing English as a Second Language*. New Delhi: Tata Mc Graw-Hill Publishing Company LTD.
- Hughes, Arthur. 2003. *Testing for Language Teachers*. (2nd ed). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Jacob, et. al 1981. *Testing ESL Composition Approach: A Practical Approach*. Massachusetts: Newbury House Publishers.
- Liu, Sha Ozhong. 2001. Studies on Transfer in Second Language Acquisition. *Guangxi Normal University Journal*, 1(3). 1-29.
- Maros, Marlyna. 2007. *Interference in Learning English: Grammatical Errors in English Essay Writing among Rural Malay Secondary School Students in Malaysia*. *Journal e-Bangi*. 2(2). 1-15.
- Olson, Judith. 2005. *Writing Skills:Success in 20 minutes a Day*. New York: Learning Express, LLC.
- O'Malley, J.Michael and Lorraine Valdez Pierce. 1995. *Authentic Assessment for English Language Learners, Practical Approaches to Teachers*. New York: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company. Inc.
- Oshima, Alice and Houge. 1993. *Writing Academic English*. New York: Addison Wesley Longman.
- Pedler, Hellen. 2006. Writing Review Text through Understanding Generic Structure. *E- Bangi Journal*. 11(2). 1-6.
- Peha, Steve, 2004. *What is good Writing*.New York: Learning express, LLC.
- Saadiyah, Darus. 2009. *Error Analysis of the Written English Essays of Secondary School Students in Malaysia: A Case Study*. *European Journal of Social Science*. 8(3). 483-495.
- Sudarwati and Eudia Grace. 2006. *Look a Head, an English for Senior High School Students Year XII (SMA/MA)*. Jakarta: Erlangga.
- Starkey, Lauren. 2004. *How to Write Great Essay*. New York: